



**WORLD TOURISM ORGANIZATION
(UNWTO)**

Final Report

**REGIONAL WORKSHOP ON "TOURISM STATISTICS AND TOURISM
SATELLITE ACCOUNTS (TSA)
(SESRIC - COMCEC - UNWTO)**

**2-4, Dec. 2014
ANKARA,
TURKEY**

**Tadayuki Hara, PhD
UNWTO Consultant**

8 December, 2014

WORKSHOP ON TOURISM STATISTICS AND TOURISM SATELLITE ACCOUNTS (SESRIC – COMCEC - UNWTO)

1. From 2nd to 4th December, 2014, a Workshop on Tourism Statistics and Tourism Satellite Accounts (TSA) was held in Ankara, Turkey. This Workshop was organized by the Statistical, Economic and Social Research and Training Centre for Islamic Countries (SESRIC) and the UNWTO. The overall framework in which this workshop occurred is called “Improving Statistical Capabilities of Tourism Sector in Mediterranean and Gulf Regions”, which is funded by the Standing Committee for Economic and Commercial Cooperation of the Organisation of Islamic Cooperation (COMCEC) under project # 2013-SESRIC-0111.
2. On behalf of the UNWTO, Mr. Oliver Herrmann, Director of Tourism Statistics and TSA, Mr. Jeannot Michel Abessolo, Consultant to African Bureau of UNWTO, Mr. Tadayuki Hara, Consultant to Tourism Statistics and TSA of UNWTO, participated in the aforementioned Workshop. According to the Agenda agreed for this event (see Annex 1), the UNWTO Consultant presented the following points related mainly to the elaboration of tourism statistics and Tourism Satellite Accounts in the following orders:

PRESENTATIONS:

- i) System of Tourism Statistics (STS)
- ii) Inbound Tourism Statistics – two sessions
- iii) Outbound Tourism Statistics
- iv) Tourism Expenditure Statistics
- v) Domestic Tourism Statistics
- vi) Tourism Industries Statistics
- vii) Employment in the Tourism Industries
- viii) Tourism Satellite Accounts (TSA)

COMPLEMENTARY INTERVENTIONS:

- i) General Discussion
3. Each session had been allocated approximately two hours, which were roughly divided into three parts – the first one for UNWTO presentations on each topic as overview, the second one for participating country presentations, and the third one for open discussions mainly questions by any participants and answers by presenting parties and UNWTO representatives. Owing to exemplary time-management skills displayed by the Chairpersons of the Workshop, Mr. Huseyin Hakan Eryetli, Project Coordinator for 2013-SESRIC-

0111, and Mr. Atilla Karaman, Project Expert for 2013-SESRIC-0111, sessions were conducted on time as scheduled.

4. The main purposes of the Workshop were to build statistical capacity in compilation, production and dissemination of tourism statistics, to contribute to capacity building programmes geared towards the needs of the National Statistical Systems (NSSs), particularly concerning the elaboration of statistics on tourism, and to share common goals to enhance NSSs to the degree that member countries can start to build some of the ten recommended tables for TSA as soon as enough inter-institutional collaboration framework became functional.
5. As is already known, last International Recommendations on Tourism Statistics (IRTS) were approved by the Statistical Commission of the United Nations in February 2008. The stage of works on this matter in each country and the methodologies applied were presented and discussed.
6. In each session, UNWTO representative started the topic by introducing some of the important technical aspects presented in official documents such as IRTS, Tourism Satellite Account: Recommended Methodological Framework 2008, International Recommendations on Tourism Statistics 2008 Compilation Guide.
7. The Workshop was geared towards statistics professionals with responsibilities in the field of tourism statistics, working in institutions such as:
 - National Tourism Administrations;
 - National Statistical Offices (both basic statistics production units and - National Accounts units);
 - Balance of Payments Departments of Central Banks; Tourism experts.
8. 50 national officers from 27 OIC Member Countries attended the Workshop (representatives from Albania, Azerbaijan, Bahrain, Benin, Chad, Cote d'Ivoire, Egypt, Indonesia, Iran, Iraq, Jordan, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Malaysia, Maldives, Morocco, Niger, Nigeria, Oman, Palestine, Qatar, Senegal, Sudan, Suriname, Tunisia, Turkey, United Arab Emirates, Uzbekistan, Yemen, together with SESRIC, UNWTO and COMCEC, were represented in the Workshop). The higher numbers of both participating countries and delegations were attributable to past encouragement of the participation of representatives of those institutions because of the responsibilities that each of them have in both processes; the improvement of the national statistical system on tourism and the specific works concerning the TSA.
9. The UNWTO Representative and delegations had an important exchange of views on: i) the constitution of Inter-institutional Platforms in order to put in practice regular working programmes on statistical researches; ii) the situation of tourism statistics; iii) the difficulties met in the reconciliation of data from different origins (demand and supply data; diagnosis of the reasons of these differences and the way to resolve them); iv) the links established with National Accounts and Balance of Payments statistics; v) the difficulties and inconsistencies related to classifications, treatment of the basic data on tourism,

and the scope of statistics from the supply side, etc., and vi) various pathways and funding towards compilation of TSA, among other methodological subjects.

10. These matters were commented on by the UNWTO Representative and in addition, other methodological issues related to the construction of TSAs, including an analysis of their relationships with the central framework of the National Accounts were discussed. In most OIC Member Countries, these links have still not been totally clarified despite the fact that TSAs are derived from this general macroeconomic compilation, such as System of National Accounts (SNA) and related national statistics.
11. A procedure based on the Supply-Use Table of the National Accounts (NA) was presented and explained to participants by the UNWTO Consultant, who emphasized the importance of determining tourism industry ratios from demand-side statistics. Also for the supply side, statistical information or estimates on the share of tourism of the total output is needed. Not all countries have this information, which is the basis of this procedure. Taxes, subsidies and margins must also be estimated. Therefore significant efforts must be made in order to gather available statistics and information on this matter.
 - i) Demand side: statistics on inbound tourism expenditure and outbound tourism expenditure are available in general terms, in most countries. Domestic tourism should be a residual in terms of tourism equilibriums. A presentation of technical relationships was also made.
 - ii) It is important to take into account that these imply a modification to the classic formulation of National Accounts equilibriums because of the nature of tourism activity.
 - iii) Table of Tourism Supply: this table depends on the assignment of primary and secondary output per tourism activity.
 - iv) Determination of intermediate consumption by tourism activities, maintaining technical coefficients of National Accounts is the next step. Output of tourism activities, (derived from tourism equilibriums) will be taken into account in order to calculate the VALUE of the Intermediate consumption of tourism industries.
 - v) At this stage, it is possible to calculate the Value Added of Tourism Activities and the share of tourism in the total Value Added.
 - vi) Last step: Construction of TSA tables 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7 and 10, which would be followed by Tables 8 and 9.

12. In various sessions it was also underlined that measuring tourism impact on the national economy –the main objective of the TSA- showing the most important relationships among tourism variables and macroeconomic indicators depends on the rearrangement of the country’s statistical system. It is in that sense that the TSA is an ongoing process and countries must determine their own practical way to reach the objective. Also the importance of inter-institutional cooperation has been emphasized by UNWTO representatives and the issue received good amount of attentions of participants as they were from varieties of institutions, including national statistical offices, national tourism administrations, central bank officials, and economic development experts, who contributed good amount of exchanges of experiences, views and opinions among the participants.
13. One issue was raised about usage of simulation or modeling to estimate some key variables. UNWTO replied that as for the TSA, data must be observed, not simulated, in line with the word “Accounting”, which is to record as accurate as possible, the actual numbers observed. In this regard, participants understood why each member’s experiences had to be shared to improve each other’s capacity improvement on tourism statistics.
14. Participants had very active role in the Workshop and time management by the Chairperson (SESRIC) ensured that most of countries and participants had enough time to express their concerns, inquiries and share their experiences with others on the floor, via simultaneous interpreters among Arabic, English, French, Russian and Turkish. As mentioned before, an important exchange of views took place and different subjects were evaluated, for example, the statistical need for future TSAs, inter-institutional coordination among different government offices, and funding arrangements for labor-intensive data collection such as household survey and border survey.

The exchanges of experiences, inquiries and opinions included but not limited to the followings as a display of substances;

- *Passport is widely used at borders for tourism statistics but that may not the same with country of residency data, which will lead to wrong information.*
- *Mirror image survey (comparing inbound and outbound statistics with origin and destination countries) is useful*
- *Those emigrated to other countries often come back to visit friends and relatives, but those are not easily captured by accommodation survey.*
- *Past advices from experienced international institutions such as World Bank, Eurostat had been helpful.*
- *Some countries introduced legal framework in which all key players of tourism must comply with government’s needs for data, while some did not implement legal framework, thus often faced with suspicious views from private sectors and respondents of surveys.*
- *One member state already estimated that tourism industry contributed as much as 27% of GDP to the economy.*
- *Training of interviewers turned out to be important to obtain visitor’s data on intercept basis.*

- *Some countries collect staffing data from hotels regularly, helping employment-related data compilation.*
 - *Decomposing profile data and personal data would be important to maintain constant access to data collected by immigration or police, as we do not need personal data.*
 - *One country presented that it uses entry and departure cards at the port of entry, together with household survey, expenditure survey, as well as suppliers' data such as accommodation facilities survey including number of rooms, occupancy rate etc.*
 - *Informal housing is growing its significance and that poses more challenges*
 - *Dissemination of our finding to people and those who cooperated would be deemed very important to ensure their continued support for data collection of tourism statistics.*
 - *In one country's case, top of the government must know the tourism statistics before any press releases, showing relative high importance of tourism to national economy.*
 - *Domestic tourism' importance to national tourism activities are overwhelming and thus one nation collect samples of 75,000 households survey to measure activities of domestic tourism, which cannot use border data.*
 - *Since TSA is such an important topic, we may have to ask UNWTO to consider utilizing international observers to check whether countries truly comply with TSA recommendations.*
 - *Leadership of SESRIC and funding by COMCEC are highly appreciated, and it would be even better if there would be a follow-up session by SESRIC.*
15. The intensive questions and answers session as well as inquiries to each participating countries revealed that members have highly diversified levels of preparations, basic statistics, funding sources, and statistical capacities of personnel, together with differing degrees of legal framework to facilitate inter-institutional collaboration towards the common national goal of tourism statistics and TSA.
16. There appear to be still some limitations on i) statistics on flow of tourists; ii) statistics on tourism expenditure under its different forms; iii) national accounts, and iv) statistics on balance of payments, (items travel and passenger transportation) in the case of some countries. Some countries are moving towards relaxing border controls with neighbouring nations to foster trades, which pose additional challenges to tourism statisticians with a loss of one important data on flow of tourists. Participants started to share the common understanding of the importance of household and accommodations surveys to enhance alternative methods to collect data on tourists. Due to this, future efforts must be focused to rectify these challenges by sharing successful practices of member countries with others.
17. A training programme on methodological aspects related to tourism statistics and TSA Methodology needs to be developed, perhaps towards introductory and intermediate level of tourism statisticians. UNWTO consultant happened to

have offered free online course on tourism industry and TSA, and with permission of the chairperson of SESRIC, it was introduced to participants as an exploratory measure to address some of the needs for training in the field of tourism statistics and TSA.

18. As displayed above, there appear to have been positive comments on the Workshop itself, but due to possible sampling errors, we rather defer an overall evaluation of the Workshop to the formal independent evaluations conducted by SESRIC in the form of participant surveys.
19. We would like to thank the Workshop organisers for their technical assistance and courtesy. I am also very grateful to all of the participants in the Workshop, for their continual interest, cooperation and friendship.

Ankara and Orlando, 8 December 2014

[Annex 1: Agenda and Country Presentations]

02 December 2014, Tuesday

09:00-09:30 **Registration**

09:30-10:00 **Opening Session**

10:00-11:00 **Session 1: System of Tourism Statistics (STS)**

▶ *Conceptual Framework of and Institutional Arrangements for a STS*

Presenter: UNWTO

▶ *Overviews of IRTS 2008 and UNWTO Compilation Guide of Tourism Statistics*

Presenter: UNWTO

11:00-11:15 **Coffee Break**

11:15-13:00 **Session 1: System of Tourism Statistics (STS) (cont'd)**

▶ *National Systems of Tourism Statistics in OIC Member Countries*

Country presentations:

- **Albania, Benin, Chad, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Palestine**

▶ *Documenting National Systems of Tourism Statistics*

Presenter: UNWTO

▶ *Q&A Session*

13:00-14:30 **Lunch Break**

14:30-16:30 **Session 2: Inbound Tourism Statistics**

▶ *Inbound Tourism Statistics and International Practices in Organizing and Conducting Border Surveys*

Presenter: UNWTO

▶ *Measuring Inbound Tourism Statistics – Type of Tools and Procedures Applied*

Country presentations:

- **Maldives, Nigeria, Senegal, Sudan, Turkey**

▶ *Q&A Session*

16:30-16:45 **Coffee Break**

16:45-18:00 **Session 2: Inbound Tourism Statistics (cont'd)**

▶ *Accommodation Statistics*

Presenter: UNWTO

▶ *Accommodation and Establishment Statistics*

Country presentations:

- **Benin, Oman, Turkey**

▶ *Q&A Session*

03 December 2014, Wednesday

09:00-11:00 **Session 3: Outbound Tourism Statistics**

▶ *Outbound Tourism Statistics*

Presenter: UNWTO

▶ *Measuring Outbound Tourism Statistics – Type of Tools and Procedures Applied*

Country presentations:

- **Egypt, Iraq, Turkey**

▶ *Q&A Session*

10:30-11:00 **Coffee Break**

11:15-13:00 **Session 4: Tourism Expenditure Statistics**

▶ *Inbound and Outbound Tourism Expenditure Statistics*

Presenter: UNWTO

▶ *Experiences on Application of Inbound and Outbound Tourism Expenditure Surveys*

Country presentations:

- **Malaysia, Suriname, Turkey**

▶ *Q&A Session*

03 December 2014, Wednesday (cont'd)

13:00-14:30 **Lunch Break**

14:30-16:00 **Session 5: Domestic Tourism Statistics**

▶ *Domestic Tourism Statistics*

Presenter: UNWTO

▶ *Measuring Domestic Tourism Statistics – Type of Tools and Procedures Applied*

Country presentations:

- **Indonesia, Malaysia, Turkey**

▶ *Q&A Session*

16:00-16:15 **Coffee Break**

16:15-18:00 **Session 6: Tourism Industries Statistics**

▶ *Measuring the Supply of Tourism Industries*

Presenter: UNWTO

▶ *Tourism Industries Statistics*

Country presentations:

- **Chad**

▶ *Q&A Session*

04 December 2014, Thursday

09:00-11:00 **Session 7: Employment in the Tourism Industries**

▶ *Measuring Employment in the Tourism Industries*

Presenter: UNWTO

▶ *Current Country Practices in Measuring Employment in the Tourism Industries*

Country presentations:

- **Azerbaijan, Yemen**

▶ *Q&A Session*

11:00-11:15 **Coffee Break**

11:15-13:00 **Session 8: Tourism Satellite Accounts (TSA)**

▶ *Towards TSA – Methodological Aspects and TSA Applications*

Presenter: UNWTO

▶ *Current Country Practices in TSA*

Country presentations:

- **Benin, Turkey**

▶ *Q&A Session*

13:00-14:30 **Lunch Break**

14:30-16:00 **Session 9: General Discussion**